

# The Effect of Project Based Learning and Problem Based Learning in Writing Narrative Text

**Igamawati Giawa**

Universitas Muslim Nusantara Al Washliyah, Medan, Indonesia

Correspondent: [igamawatiagiawa@gmail.com](mailto:igamawatiagiawa@gmail.com)

Article history: received May 13, 2022; revised June 10, 2022; accepted June 28, 2022

This article is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/)



**Abstract:** This study was made to find out the effect of Project Based Learning and Problem Based Learning in Writing Narrative Texts to grade XI students of SMA Swasta AL-Hikmah Medan. The researcher used experimental research. The sample of this research. The sample were 78 students of the grade XI students of SMA Swasta AL-Hikmah Medan in Academic Year 2020/2021, with population 78 students from three classes. The researcher used total random sampling technique. There were 26 students taught by using Project Based Learning method, 26 students taught by using Problem Based Learning method and 26 students as control group. The instrument used writing test to measure Project Based Learning and Problem Based Learning. The technique of data analysis is One Way Analysis of Variance (ANNOVA) with significance level  $p=0,21 > 0,05$  or  $F_{hitung}=7,355 > F_{table}=3,12$ . It was found that Project Based Learning, Problem Based Learning Methods and Control Group have different effect on students' writing achievement of narrative texts. Project Based Learning is more effective than Problem Based Learning. Based on the results, the researchers recommended adopting the Project-Based Learning in teaching and learning situations, especially English teachers, to implement project-based learning in the teaching and learning process of writing. so that students are more active and can think critically both among students and also to teachers.

**Keywords:** Project Based Learning, Problem Based Learning, Writing

## I. INTRODUCTION

In English language teaching, there are four primary skills which is important, namely listening, speaking, reading, and writing. Harmer (2007:265) states that there are four skills in language that often divided into two types. Receptive skills is extracted from the discourse. It is a term used for reading and listening. Productive skills is the term for speaking and writing skills where students have to produce language. Among these four skills, writing has assumed as one of difficult skill. In writing, the main goal is to help the students be able to transfer their ideas in written form whether it is academic or nonacademic writing that can be read by others. The knowledge of English includes seven subjects, namely: English Grammar, English language teaching, Approach to English language teaching (ELT), History of the English Language, Translation, Expository writing, and public speaking (Fauziati, 209:12). Writing skill is the complex form of communication.

Based on the syllabus, learning writing in Senior High School especially in second grade is limited on descriptive text, recount text, procedure text, and narative text. Among the texts which are mentioned above, narrative text is considered as the most interesting text. According to Mark & Anderson in Hidayah (2018:3) define a narrative text is a piece of text which tell a story and, in doing so, entertains or informs the reader or listener. The text consists of orientation, complication, or problems and resolution. Based on the researcher's experience, the students were expected to understand the text, but many students still find difficulties in reaching the goal. They sometimes cannot find the ideas of whole the text. The students are difficult to comprehend the text, it makes them confused. Finally, the students do not understand the plot of the whole story. In fact shows that many students do not like to write English text. In addition, if there are appropriate Technique, it will be possible to change the students' attitude in writing, that writing can be an interesting, easy and enjoyable activity. Markham (2011) describes students learn knowledge and elements of the core curriculum, but also apply what they know to solve authentic problems and produce results that matter.

Brown (2001: 35) states writing products are often the result of thinking, drafting, and revising procedures that require specialized skills, skills that are not every speaker develops naturally. Writing is a complex activity since it requires students' comprehension abilities such as mastering grammar, vocabulary, and punctuation. Bello (1997) states that writing enhances language acquisition as learners experiment with words, sentences, and other elements of writing

to communicate their idea effectively, and to reinforce the grammar and vocabulary they are learning in class. Writing skill is included in main standard tests worldwide as well as nationwide, as writing assessment is employed as a part of performance assessment in classroom testing at junior until high school level (Yeon Yi, 2009: 53). Based on Heaton (1991), there are five general components of main area in writing, they are language use, mechanical skill, treatment of content, stylistic skills, and judgments skills. Raimes (1983) states that writing is considered as a tool in learning because of some reasons. First, while students are writing, they apply their knowledge of grammatical structures, idioms, and vocabulary. According to Hinkle (2004:18) writing is expected in most undergraduate course, and it is not unusual for students to have to produce up to a dozen written assignments per term. Nation (2009:13) states that writing is an activity that can usefully be prepared for by work in the other skills of listening, speaking and reading. This preparation can make it possible for words that have been used receptively to come into productive use. Murray and Sarah (2006:20) state that academic writing is not the printed display of one's fully formed thoughts. Broughton et.al., (1980:116) defines that act of writing differs from that of talking. In addition, Harmer (2004: 40) states that frequently useful as preparation for some other activity, in particular when students write sentences as a preamble to discussion activities. According to Hogue and Ann (2007:14) academic writing is the kind of writing used in high school and college classes, it is different from creative writing, which is the kind of writing you do when you write stories. Brown (2004:218) states that 'writing is primarily a convention for recording speech and for reinforcing grammatical and lexical features of language'. Beside to write well, the students are expected to be able present their ideas in the written form as writing is a means communication. However, people think that writing is not only presenting ideas to others but also using energy to complete the writing process itself, thinking ideas, preparing the outlines, transferring the outline into draft, revising the draft, and finally proofreading the draft to prepare for the final outcome.

### **1.1 Teaching Writing**

Writing is an activity that produces something from mind becomes meaningful text or sentence. It has many purposes not only for media as expressing idea but also giving information. Therefore Indonesian students must have good writing ability so that they can express their ideas in written form to give information to the reader. According to Murcia (2003:219) teaching academic writing to both native and non-native speakers of English is an enterprise that unfolds in such a countless variety of settings and classrooms around the world that it is not hard to imagine considerable variation in how writing gets taught. the goal of the ESL writing teacher is to provide information about and context for practicing clear, fluent, effective communication of writing ideas Richards and Ur in Reid (1993:149).

### **1.2 The Process of Writing**

Harmer (2004:12) Process writing is a way of looking at what people do when they compose written text. To make written product, the writer need doing the process before the results done. There are some processes to make written product. Hogue and Ann (2007:15) Writing is never one-step action, it is ongoing creative act. According to Richards (2002:316) this is the activities provide the learning experiences for students at this stage:

- 1) Group Brainstorming  
Group members spew out ideas about the topic. Spontaneity is important here there are no right or wrong answers.
- 2) Drafting Stage  
It is the writing process of down ideas, organizing them into sequence, and providing the reader with a frame for understanding these ideas.
- 3) Editing (Reflecting and Revising) Stage  
In this stage which refers to the process of reflecting and revising based on the evaluation of the writing. It gets students to go back over their writing and make changes to its style, grammatical and lexical correctness, and appropriateness. The reflecting and revising also helped other readers or editors who want give comment and suggestions.
- 4) Final Version Stage  
Final version stage is the writer have edited their draft, making change their consider to be necessary, they produce their final version. This may look considerably different from both the original plan and the first draft, because things have changed in the editing process. The result of this stage the writer can produces their writing.

### **1.3 Types of classroom Writing**

Nation (2009:116) says that there are eleven types of writing. The eleven types of writing are as follow 1) A note of formal letter, 2) A formal letter, 3) Resume, summary, paraphrase, 4) Narrative, 5) Description, 6) Exposition, analysis, definition, classification, 7) Narrative, description, with evaluative comment, 8) Argument, 9) Literary, 10) Advertisement, media, 1) Journal writing.

### **1.4 Definition Of Technique**

The way in teaching can be concluded as a technique in teaching English. Technique is a way of doing something

or the method to convey the idea in teaching, technique any exercise, activities and task in the classroom to meet the objective or goals of learning (Jeremy Harmer 2001:201).

### **1.5 Definition of Project Based Learning and Problem Based Learning**

Bell (2010:41) defines Project-Based Learning (PJBL) is a technique to instruction that teaches curriculum concepts through a project. According to Boss and Jane (2013:5) project-based learning is students gain important knowledge, skills, and dispositions by investigating open-ended questions to “make meaning” that they transmit in purposeful ways. In contrast, PJBL technique is student centered. Students have a degree of control over what they learn, how they learn, and how they express their learning Boss and Jane (2013:7). Project-Based Learning is an instructional technique centered on the learner. Through the construction of a personally-meaningful artifact, which may be a play, a multimedia presentation or a poem, learners represent what they have learned. Project-Based Learning is a comprehensive technique to classroom teaching and learning that is designed to engage students in investigation of complex, authentic problems and carefully designed products and tasks (Blumenfeld et al., 1991).

The problem based learning technique is a group of teaching learning process that is focused to the process of problem solving which is faced scientifically. It is kind of technique that challenges students to learn through engagement in a real problem. Tan (2004:7) Problem-based learning (PBL) technique focuses on the challenge of making students’ thinking visible. Like most pedagogical innovations, PBL technique was not developed on the basis of learning or psychological theories, although the PBL process embraces the use of metacognition and self-regulation. PBL technique is recognized as a progressive active-learning and learner-centered technique where unstructured problems (real-world or simulated complex problems) are used as the starting point and anchor for the learning process. According to Moallem et al.(2012:4) PBL technique can be defined as a pedagogical system used in tertiary education both undergraduate and graduate, particularly in medicine but also in fields as diverse as law, engineering, psychology, and liberal arts. According to Barrows in Azman (2012:6), problem based learning technique is a learning method based on the principle of using real-world problems as a starting point for the acquisition and integration of new knowledge.

### **1.6 Definition of Narrative Text**

Anderson (1998: 8) says that narrative text is a piece of text which tells a story and in doing so entertains and informs the reader or listener. Narrative is a type of essay that tells a story or a series of events in which they occur. Its purpose is to give meaning to an event or a series of events by telling story.

Derewianka (1990: 32) states that he steps for constructing a narrative are:

1. Orientation, in which the writer tells the audience about who the character in the story are, where the story is taking place, and when the action is happen.
2. Complication, where the story is pushed along by a series of events, during which we usually expect some sort of complication or problem to arise.
3. Resolution In a “satisfying “narrative, a resolution of the complication is brought about. The complication may be resolved for better or for worse, but certainly types of narrative, which leave us wondering (how is the end?).

## **II. METHOD**

The experimental research design of this study included three groups which are Experimental group 1, Experimental group 2 and Control group. This research according to Creswell (2009:48), quantitative research in approach for testing objective theories by examining the relationship among variables. These variables, in can be measured, typically on instruments, so that numbered data can be analyzed using statistical procedures would be conducted by using experimental research. An experiment involves making a change in the value of one variable called the independent variable an observing the effect of that change on another variable called dependent variable and the independent variables are isolated and controlled carefully. There were two variables in this research namely: Project based learning technique and Problem based learning technique and dependent variable Writing achievement.

### **2.1. The Population and Sample**

The population was generalization area to consisting of subject/object that has certain quality and characteristics which was determined by the researcher to be studied. “Sarwono (2006:111) stated population is a unit of analysis which complete and which is researching”. Sarwono (2006: 111) states that sample was the element of population which would be selected for to do research”. In this research, the researcher use random sampling to get the sample. The sample would take 3 classes.

### **2.2. The Instrument and The Technique**

The data was collecting by experimental quantitative data. The students would have a test by the researcher in this research. The researcher would use the writing test as the instrument for collecting data. To get the data in this study, there were three stages were taking by researcher: 1) Pre-Test, 2) Treatment, 3) Post Test.

### 2.3. Assesment of Writing

According to Brown (2004: 241-246), there are three scoring methods for responsive and extensive writing. They are, holistic scoring, primary trait scoring, and analytic scoring. In holistic scoring, each point on a holistic scale is given a systematic set of descriptors, and the reader-evaluator matches an overall impression with the descriptors to arrive at a score.

### 2.4. The Validity of the Test

A test will be considered valid if the test measured the object to be measured and suitable with the criteria (Hatch and Farhady, 1982:250). Heaton (1988:159) also states that validity of the test was the extent to which it measures what it was supposed to measure. A test must aim to provide true measure of the particular skill which it is intended to measure. There are four types of validity they are: (1) face validity, concerns with the lay out of the test; (2) content validity, depends on a careful analysis of the language being stated; (3) construct validity; measured certain specific characteristic in accordance with a theory of language learning; (4) criterion-related validity, concerns with measuring the success in the future, as in replacement test.

### 2.5. Technique of Analyzing Data

One way ANOVA Repeated Measures was used to compare three or more group means where the participants were the same in each group. This usually occurred in two situations: (1) when participants were measured multiple times to see changes to an intervention; or (2) when participants were subjected to more than one condition/trial and the response to each of these conditions wants to be compared.

## III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The instrument used writing test to measure Project Based Learning and Problem Based Learning. The technique of data analysis is One Way Analysis of Variance (ANNOVA) with significance level  $p=0,21 > 0,05$  or  $F_{hitung}=7,355 > F_{table}=3,12$ . It was found that Project Based Learning, Problem Based Learning Methods and Control Group have different effect on students' writing achievement of narrative texts. Project Based Learning is more effective than Problem Based Learning. Based on the results, the researchers recommended adopting the Project-Based Learning in teaching and learning situations, especially English teachers, to implement project-based learning in the teaching and learning process of writing. so that students are more active and can think critically both among students and also to teachers.

## IV. CONCLUSIONS

1. It was found that there was a significant of students writing achievement through Project Based Learning technique in the first experimental class. It can be seen from the mean score of the students' writing test was 86,15 with the maximum score was 90 and the minimum score was 75 and from the everage in enhancement the largest score was 18.077 in first experimental class was taught by project based learning technique.
2. It was found that there was a significant of students writing achievement through Problem Based Learning in the second experimental class . It can be seen from the mean score of the students' writing test was 76,5 with the highest score was 85 and the lowest score was 70 and from the everage score in enhancement was 16.154 in the second experimental class was taught by problem based learning technique.
3. After analyzing the data, it can be concluded that the students achievement in writing on experimental class at SMA Swasta AL-Hikmah Medan is more effective by using Project Based Learning technique. Project Based Learning technique help the students in SMA Swasta Al-Hikmah Medan to improve students' independent level writing ability in particular in writing narrative.

## REFERENCES

- Anderson, Mark and Anderson, Kathy. (1998). *Text Types in English 3*. South Yara: Macmilan Education Australia PIY LTD.
- Azman, Norzaini. (2012). *Problem Based Learning in ESL*. The International Jurnal of Universitas Kebangsaan Malaysia.
- Bell, Stephanie. (2010). *Project-Based Leraning for the 21st Century: Skills for the Future*. The Clearing House, 83: 39-43. Routledge Taylor : Francis Group, LLC.
- Bello, T. 1997. *Writing Topics for Adult ESL Students*. Paper presented at the 31st Annual Teachers of English to Speakers of Other Language Convention.
- Blumenfeld, & Krajcik, Joseph S, Phyllis c. (1991). *Motivating Project-Based Learning:Sustaining the doing, suporting the learning*. Educational Psychologist, 26 (3), 369-398.

- 
- Boss Suzie Krauss, Jane. (2013). *Thinking Through Project-based Learning*. United States of America.
- Broughton, Geoffrey et.al. (1980). *Teaching English AS A Foreign Language*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Brown, H. (2004). *Language Asesment: Principles and Clasrom Practices*. New York: Longman.com.
- Brown, H. Douglas. (2001). *Teaching by Principles An Interactive Aproach to Language Pedagogy 2nd Ed*. New York: Adison Wesley Longman.
- Derewianka, Beverly. (1990). *Exploring How Texts Work*. London: Primary English Teaching Asociation. Education-Theory, Practice and Ruber Sling Shots. 51:287-314.
- Fauziati, Endang. (2009). *Reading on Aplied Linguistics*. Surakarta: Era pustaka.
- Harmer, Jeremy. (2004). *How To Teach Englis h*. New York: Longman.
- Harmer, Jeremy. (2007). *How To Teach Writng*. New York: Longman.
- Hatch,E. And Farhady.( 1982). *Research Designed and Statistic for Applied liguistic*. New York